

UCD GEARY INSTITUTE DISCUSSION PAPER SERIES

Non-Technical Skills (NTS) for Enhancing Patient Safety: Achievements and Future Directions

This article was first published in *Japanese Journal of Quality and Safety in Healthcare* 7(4): 360-370, November 2012.

> Naonori Kodate University College Dublin

Alastair J. Ross St. Thomas' Hospital, London, UK

> Janet E. Anderson King's College London, UK

Rhona Flin University of Aberdeen, UK

> Geary WP2012/27 November 2012

UCD Geary Institute Discussion Papers often represent preliminary work and are circulated to encourage discussion. Citation of such a paper should account for its provisional character. A revised version may be available directly from the author.

Any opinions expressed here are those of the author(s) and not those of UCD Geary Institute. Research published in this series may include views on policy, but the institute itself takes no institutional policy positions.

Non-Technical Skills (NTS) for Enhancing Patient Safety: Achievements and Future Directions

N Kodate¹⁾ KODATE, Naonori JE Anderson³⁾ ANDERSON, Janet R Flin⁴⁾ FLIN, Rhona

1) Lecturer, School of Applied Social Science, University College Dublin (UCD); Research Fellow, UCD Geary Institute, Ireland Senior Fellow, Todai Policy Alternatives Research Institute (PARI), University of Tokyo, Japan.

2) Senior Research Fellow, Simulation and Interactive Learning Centre (SaIL), St. Thomas' Hospital, London, UK.

3) Senior Lecturer, Florence Nightingale School of Nursing and Midwifery, King's College London (KCL), UK.

4) Professor of Applied Psychology, School of Psychology, University of Aberdeen, UK.

Introduction

Problems in team communication and decision making have been implicated in accidents in high risk industries such as aviation, off shore oil processing, and nuclear power generation. Recognition of the role that breakdowns in communication and teamwork play in patient safety incidents has led to a plethora of studies in the area of what has come to be widely known as non-technical skills (NTS); a term initially used in European aviation¹⁾. This has led to increasing interest in identifying, assessing, training and measuring non-technical skills. Technical skills are the procedural and clinical skills that healthcare professionals apply when diagnosing, monitoring and treating patients¹⁾. Non-technical skills refer to the general cognitive and social skills that allow them to, among other things, monitor the situation, make decisions, take a leadership role, communicate and co-ordinate their actions within a team, in order to achieve high levels of safety and efficiency.

There is growing awareness that non-technical skills are essential for competent practice and NTS have been incorporated into medical education and training programmes²⁾. Internationally, a module on human factors is one component of the World

Health Organization (WHO)'s curriculum on patient safety for medical students ^{3), 4)}. In the UK, serious deficiencies in the undergraduate medical curriculum were highlighted by Parliament's Health Committee Report⁵⁾. Now the Royal Colleges of Surgeons in Great Britain and Ireland all provide training in NTS although to varying degrees of extent, coverage and financial support for medical students and trainees. One notable example is that the Royal College of Surgeons of Edinburgh began to offer a course called NOTSS (Non-technical Skills for Surgeons)⁶⁾ in conjunction with the University of Aberdeen in 2006 ⁷⁾. This has now developed into two courses. One is a multidisciplinary course called Safer Operative Surgery, which encompasses wider safety issues surrounding surgical teams (Yule et al., 2009; The Royal College of Surgeons of Edinburgh website). The other is a NOTSS Masterclass for surgeons who want to train and assess these skills using the NOTSS system. Although the examples in this article deal primarily with the National Health Services in the UK, NTS are being applied by healthcare practitioners and research groups worldwide, and Japan is no exception $^{8)-12)}$.

In this paper we aim to give an overview of the development and application of NTS in healthcare and offer some thoughts about its future directions. We start by outlining the importance of nontechnical skills (NTS) in healthcare, with a focus on patient safety and quality of care, and then provide an overview of how NTS are identified, trained and assessed before considering future directions for NTS theory and practice. We conclude that the future of NTS in healthcare is likely to: a) pay more attention to skills such as inter-professional teamwork and communication with patients (e.g. care and compassion), providing scientific rigour and replicability can be brought to bear on this area; and b) incorporate an appropriate context from systemstheories, in line with recent developments in cognitive science and resilience engineering.

What are non-technical skills

NTS theory and practice has its roots in Crew Resource Management (CRM) techniques developed in aviation¹³⁾ and later applied in other domains^{14), 15)}. It also has been influenced by cognitive engineering approaches that investigate the key role of cognitive skills in many work tasks, using methods such as Cognitive Task Analysis to identify them ¹⁶⁾.

Definitional aspects remain a contentious issue. Both 'non-technical'¹⁷⁾ and 'skills'¹⁸⁾ have been criticised as misleading and imprecise terms. Further, there is a debate around whether the term 'soft skills' is synonymous ¹⁹⁾ or compatible ²⁰⁾ with NTS ('there is nothing soft about non-technical skills') ^{21: p455)}.

These ongoing debates notwithstanding, it seems beyond question that a) NTS is a term in common usage and b) there is broadly a shared understanding of the cognitive and behavioural factors covered ²²⁾. It can be noted that terminology around 'human error' and 'human factors' has been similarly debated in recent years ²³⁾ but the contribution towards patient safety made by behavioural, cognitive and organizational science is generally recognised ^{24, 25)}.

Although the NTS that are most relevant to effective performance may vary according to work demands, it is possible to identify the core NTS that are commonly required in high risk industries. Most training courses for NTS are concentrated around a

NTS	Skill components
Situation awareness	• gathering information
	 recognising and understanding
	 anticipating future states
Decision Making	 defining the problem
	 identifying options
	 balancing risks and selecting options
	 reassessing/reviewing outcomes
Communication skills	 giving information clearly and concisely
	 including context and intent
	 receiving information
	 identifying and tackling barriers to communication
Team working	 supporting others
	 solving conflicts
	 exchanging information
	 coordinating activities
Leadership	• using authority and assertiveness
ľ	 maintaining standards
	• planning and prioritizing
	 managing workload and resources
Stucco monomont	· identifier a supertorne of starses
Stress management	• identifying symptoms of stress
	recognising effects of stress
Fatimer and a second	• implementing coping strategies
Fatigue management	• identifying symptoms of fatigue
	• recognising effects of fatigue
	 implementing coping strategies

Table 1: Core non-technical skills (21: p454)

特集

set of core components originally derived from CRM work in aviation and these have been outlined by Flin, O'Connor and Crichton ^{1), 8)}, Their list of NTS skill categories and component elements has been applied to healthcare by Engle et al ²¹⁾ (see Table 1).

Identifying NTS

One of the underlying assumptions in this area is that NTS can be trained and assessed. This means that in order to develop training programmes, the relevant NTS for a particular clinical area or occupational group have to be identified. Identification of NTS has to be systematic and objective. This is challenging because non-technical skills are not always directly observable and particularly in the case of cognitive skills, must be inferred from people's behaviour. There can also be ambiguity in the interpretation of observations meaning that some degree of subjectivity is inevitable. The identification of relevant NTS is therefore more challenging than the identification of technical skills. Different researchers have approached the identification of NTS in different ways, but in general all the methods are underpinned by human factors approaches to the analysis of work, such as task analysis methods.

Identification of the NTS required for a given job can be based on existing taxonomies for other occupations but will need to be augmented with data gathered from the relevant domain. Some of the generic NTS categories (e.g. situation awareness and teamwork) are likely to be applicable but not all roles in a work team require leadership or decision making as key facets of their responsibilities. Moreover, the specific behaviours and the level of skill required can be very different for particular occupations. The use of several methods to gather data is recommended and can include questionnaires, interviews, focus groups, analysis of adverse events and observations. Flin et al (2008)^{1), 8)} recommend data triangulation,

Table 2: NTS identification vignette²⁶⁾

Developing behavioural markers for Emergency Physicians' non-technical skills			
Clinical area	Emergency Medicine		
Participants	Physicians and nurses		
Site	UK, large urban city, two Emergency Departments in teaching hospitals		
Purpose	Identifying NTS to develop behavioural marker system for the observational assessment of emergency physicians' non-technical skills in the workplace		
	Tool designed for use in formative assessment: to promote reflection, guide future learning, and monitor progress		
NTS definition	"the cognitive, social and personal resource skills that complement technical skills, and contribute to safe and efficient task performance"		
Key NTS categories	Leadership; decision making; communication skills; situation awareness; team working		
Key NTS components	Maintaining standards; managing workload; resolving conflict; team building;supporting others; teaching and providing feedback; using authority and assertiveness; co-ordinating team members; supervising/assessing capabilities		
Methods	Triangulation of data from a number of sources		
	Phase 1: a provisional assessment tool was developed according to published literature and curricula		
	Phase 2: analysis of staff interviews and field observations to determine whether the skill list contained any significant omissions; identify behavioural markers linked to nontechnical skills in the context of the emergency department (ED); establish whether skills included in the tool were observable		
	Phase 3: evaluating the content validity index of exemplary behaviours, using a survey of experts		
Outcomes	Behavioural marker system for NTS of emergency physicians		
Learning points	20hrs of observation were sufficient to identify key NTS		
Limitations	Limited to two EDs; self-selecting group of participant clinicians with attendance at patient safety meetings may not be fully representative		

the development of a preliminary taxonomy and then further development and validation, especially if a behavioural rating scale is being developed as well as a training programme.

Table 2 shows an example of a recent study of NTS in Emergency Medicine in which a behavioural marker system for formative assessment was developed.

Training NTS

NTS can be trained using a wide range of training techniques, including didactic lectures, demonstrations, and practice based methods such as role play, and simulated exercises with varying degrees of fidelity. Many NTS courses, based on CRM techniques from aviation, are now used widely in many high risk industries, including healthcare. Application has been extended to a range of clinical domains including anaesthesia, surgery, emergency

Table 3: NTS training vignette ^{32), 37), 38)}

medicine and primary care^{19), 27), 28)}

- There are typically three phases to CRM training:
- Raising awareness of NTS and their importance; this is usually accomplished by introducing NTS in an educational session such as a lecture. Specific lectures then follow on individual NTS categories. Pre- course reading introducing the topics can also be provided
- Skill practice using exercises and simulations; this is usually followed by feedback and discussion of performance to enable participants to understand how NTS contributed to the outcome of the exercise, and to reflect on their experience.
- Reinforcement of NTS in the workplace or involving refresher courses.

Recent years have seen a steady growth in the application of medical simulation modalities to the study of, for example, teamwork ²⁹⁾, leadership ³⁰⁾, empathy ³¹⁾ and staff-patient communication ³²⁾.

Simulation training fo	or improving the quality of care for older people
Clinical area	Care of the older person
Participants	Inter professional including Nurses, Healthcare Assistants, Doctors, Physiotherapists, Nutritionists
Site	UK, large urban NHS teaching hospital, three geriatric wards
Purpose	Inter-professional team training aimed at enhanced patient experiences
NTS definition	Broad, including teamwork (e.g. shared mental models) and compassionate communication with patients (including awareness of voice, posture etc.)
Key NTS categories	Leadership; team working; communication skills; decision making; situation awareness
Key NTS components	Trust; team orientation; backup; shared mental model
Methods	Hi and Lo fidelity simulation; classroom exercises
	Mixed-methods independent evaluation including validated questionnaires, observation, interview
Outcomes	Learners' self-confidence on clinical competencies increased post-training
	Knowledge for achieving better care was learned and retained at follow up 7-9 weeks post- training
Learning points	The study is important because high quality communication goes beyond the transmission and reception of information and becomes 'real dialogue' $^{\rm 39)}$
	Compassionate care is at the core of the NHS constitution 40 and championed by the Nursing and Midwifery Council and the General Medical Council, yet it has been argued that nursing training has become increasingly academic 41 with a loss of core values such as compassionate care 42
	Study conclusions are that NTS training can be defined broadly to include team communication, patient interaction and empathy, in addition to traditional conceptualisations which emphasise cognitive skills such as situation awareness and decision making
Limitations	Limited involvement from student nurses and agency (bank) staff

Ward-based simulations ³³⁾, exercises in high fidelity simulation suites ^{34), 35)} and in situ or mobile simulations ³⁶⁾ have all been applied to the training of non-technical skills to positive effect. Table 3 shows an example of a recent study of combined wardbased and high fidelity suite- based simulation for the training of non-technical skills in a multidisciplinary team for the care of older people.

Assessing NTS

Formal methods for assessing NTS are required for the following purposes:

- 1. To give training programme participants feedback about their level of skill
- 2. To test skills for a licensing programme

Table 4: NTS assessment vignette ⁵²⁾

- 3. To evaluate the effectiveness of a training programme and to assess whether skills have transferred to the work environment
- To audit skill levels in a team or department for ongoing training and development needs ^{1), 8)}

Behavioural marker systems have been developed to define the different components of the skills and to give positive and negative examples of practice relating to the skill. These are usually combined with a rating scale that allows observers to rate how effectively the skill is being practised. Rating scales can have varying formats but should adhere to the principle of having good psychometric properties, including reliability, validity and sensitivity. Observers usually require extensive training. Using video for recording performance and later analysis

Assessing Scrub Practit	cioners' Intraoperative Non-Technical Skills using the SPLINTS system
Clinical area	Operating theatre team
Participants	Scrub practitioners (nurse, operating department practitioner, or instrument technician)
Site	Northern UK, off site - based on video simulation
Purpose	Validate (reliability, validity, usability) the SPLINTS tool for assessing scrub practitioners' NTS
NTS definition	"the cognitive, social and personal resource skills that complement technical skills, and contribute to safe and efficient task performance"
Key NTS categories	Situation awareness, communication and teamwork, task management
Key NTS components	Gathering information; recognising and understanding information;anticipating; acting assertively; exchanging information; coordinating with others; planning; providing and maintaining standards; coping with pressure
Methods	Introduction to human factors concepts (3 h) and trained in the use of the SPLINTS system (2 h)
	Practice with using the tool to rate behaviours seen in a simulated video scenario (1 h)
	Used SPLINTS to rate the performance of scrub practitioners seen in seven standardized simulated, surgical video scenarios (1 h).
Outcomes	Non-technical skills of scrub practitioners can be identified (from behaviours seen in realistic scenarios showing scrub practitioner performance in the intraoperative phase of surgery) using the SPLINTS system
	The results indicate that the SPLINTS system has a consistent internal structure, and can bused with a reasonable level of accuracy to rate performance in simulated scenarios, when compared with subject matter expert ratings
	Participants indicated that the SPLINTS system is usable and contains the most important non-technical skills for the scrub practitioner to perform effectively
	Even with minimal training, scrub practitioners can use the SPLINTS behavioural rating system to reliably rate the non-technical skills performance of scrub practitioners seen in simulated, standardized video scenarios
Learning points	Providing a common language and a structured method for rating and training non-technica skills could take scrub practitioners one step closer to reducing the still unacceptably high adverse event rate seen in the operating theatre
Limitations	Fairly small number of participants (n= 34); The use of semi-scripted recorded scenarios rather than live or recorded operating theatre situations meant that some of the scenarios may have seemed more realistic than others

of performance allows multiple raters to observe the same scenarios and compare their interpretations, increasing the reliability of the ratings.

A number of behavior rating systems have been designed and developed for specific specialties, including the operating theatre teams (Oxford NOTECHS)⁴³⁾ and associated professional groups such as anaesthetists (ANTS)^{44), 45)}, surgeons (NOTSS)^{6), 46), 47)} and scrub practitioners (SPLINTS)^{48), 49)}. Parker et al. (2012) describe a specific inventory for surgical leadership⁵⁰⁾. Hull et al. (2012) also outline the use of a number of global performance rating scales applied to non-technical performance⁵¹⁾.

Table 4 shows an example of a recent study assessing the psychometric properties of a new NTS behavioural rating system.

Future Directions

Definition

As more healthcare practitioners and health sciences researchers become familiar with the broad area of NTS, the definition of NTS is being reconsidered, especially in relation to interactions with patients. In the operating theatre where most NTS research in healthcare has taken place, patients are normally anaesthetised. A fundamental question is whether interpersonal and listening skills that are essential for good patient care should be considered as a category of NTS. Ross et al. argue that compassionate and empathetic communication with patients, for example, are important not just for patient experiences but for safety and quality and thus should be considered key NTS ³⁸⁾. However most researchers continue to focus on NTS as applied to co-ordination and communication between team members but not between healthcare professionals and their patients.

Clinical areas

Although NTS is a general term, its application in healthcare has tended to focus on acute specialities such as anaethesia ⁵³⁾ and surgery ⁵⁴⁾. In cognitive terms, the thrust of much work has been towards features of individual cognitive performance such as situation awareness, planning and decision making ³³⁾. Nevertheless, an important strand in surgical work has been the cross-disciplinary nature of study in this area ⁵⁵⁾. Applications concerned specifically with nurses' teamwork and cognitive skills are becoming more visible in the literature (e.g. resuscitation teams ⁵⁶⁾; scrub practitioners ^{48), 52)}; midwives ⁵⁷⁾) but this is an area that has room to develop ⁵⁸⁾.

System perspective and resilience

Researchers have approached NTS mostly at the level of individual behaviours, as in most healthcare domains practitioners do not always work with the same team. Hence each worker requires portable NTS that they can apply in any team and accordingly NTS are assessed on an individual basis. Saurin et al. (2012) argue that traditional categories (e.g. situation awareness) derived from CRM have been applied via methods that 'adopt, implicitly, paradigms that are based on cognition in the mind, rather than cognition in the wild^{'15)}. This refers to the emerging areas of distributed cognition ⁵⁹⁾ and situated cognition ⁶⁰⁾ wherein cognition is interpreted as bound in situ within social, cultural and physical contexts. Without a better understanding of interactions between individual professionals and these contextual factors, post-training teams will not be able to fully utilize their newly acquired NTS in a sustained manner. There also needs to be organizational support, such as senior management commitment to institutional resources, development of official policies and creation of 'champions'²⁷⁾. The main implication for developing NTS applications is that NTS should be approached from a systems-level perspective if they are to be ultimately successful in increasing flexibility and adaptation in organizations. Important consideration should be given to the context in which skills are performed: newly trained NTS can only be applied if the organizational culture is supportive and facilitates the expression of these skills⁶¹⁾.

Saurin et al. (2012) suggest that applying Resilience Engineering principles to NTS could be fruitful¹⁵⁾. Resilience Engineering is 'an emerging discipline which 'emphasizes the capacity of a system to adapt safely to changing conditions' ⁶²⁾ even when unexpected conditions are encountered ⁶³⁾. Resilience is viewed as an emergent feature of the work system ⁶⁴⁾ and the focus moves beyond human error ^{65), 66)} towards understanding the adaptive capacity of the system and how people anticipate, deal with and recover from difficult demands and challenging conditions ^{66), 67)}. This perspective suggests an additional application of NTS work; it will be important to develop ideas about how the core skills and components (see Table 1) reflect organizational or systems level adaptations to fluctuations and pressures in the work system. Training would focus less on rating individual behaviour and more holistically on interactions between NTS categories, and the relationship between NTS and technology, resources and work systems including documents, procedures and policies.

NTS achievements to date

There is general acceptance that the introduction of NTS concepts into healthcare via training, development and research has had an impact on medical outcomes. Hull et al. (2012) conclude in a review of surgery that 'Although the available literature is somewhat heterogeneous, this review provides evidence that [NTS] skills can and do have an effect on surgeons' technical performance'⁵¹⁾. Similarly, another simulation study found a strong correlation between technical and non-technical skills⁶⁸⁾. Moreover, recent prospective observational studies demonstrate that surgeons' NTS can be reliably measured using various work-based assessment methods^{69), 70)}.

Conclusions

In this paper we have outlined the importance of NTS in healthcare and some of its contributions to patient safety and quality of care. Examples have been provided of how they are identified, trained and assessed. It can be concluded that future directions for NTS theory and practice involve: increasing applications in nursing and interprofessional environments; focus on skills for interacting with patients ; approaches that consider cognition in complex systems. Amalberti et al. (2001) describe a 'plateau' reached by tools derived from CRM in 'ultra-safe' industries that already have high safety records⁷¹⁾. These are levels of safety that healthcare strives to emulate and CRM approaches may help to play a part in that endeavour. It is thus important that the field of NTS in healthcare continues to evolve. The future of NTS in healthcare is likely to: a) attend to skills such as teamwork, leadership and communication skills, providing scientific rigour and replicability can be brought to bear on this area; and b) incorporate systems-theoretical extensions, in line with recent developments in cognitive science and resilience engineering.

Acknowledgements

We would like to thank all those who participated in and supported the Anglo-Japanese collaboration for Improving Patient Safety (AnJIPS) project (2011-2012), funded by the Daiwa Anglo-Japanese Foundation. Special thanks to Dr Ken Taneda, Dr Kenji Harada, Mr Michael Marrinan, Professor Yasushi Kodama and Dr Chiaki Sato.

References

- Flin R, O'Connor P, Crichton M: Safety at the sharp end: a guide to non-technical skills. Ashgate, Aldershot, 2008.
- Gordon M, Darbyshire D, Baker P: Nontechnical skills training to enhance patient safety: a systematic review. *Medical Education* 46(11):1042-1054, 2012.
- WHO Alliance for Patient Safety: WHO patient safety curriculum guide for medical schools.
 2009 [22.09.2012]; Available from: www.who.int/ patientsafety/education/medical_curriculum/en/ index.html
- 4) World Health Organization: Patient Safety Curriculum Guide: Multi-professional Edition. In: WHO (Ed): Geneva, 2011.
- 5) House of Commons Health Committee: Patient

Safety. 6th Report of session 2008-09. Stationery Office, London, 2009.

- 6) University of Aberdeen: The Non-Technical Skills for Surgeons (NOTSS) System Handbook: Industrial Psychology Research Centre, School of Psychology, University of Aberdeen, 2007. Available from: http://www.abdn.ac.uk/iprc/notss/
- 7) Flin R, Yule S, Paterson-Brown S, Maran N, Rowley D, Youngson G: Teaching surgeons about non-technical skills. *The surgeon : journal of the Royal Colleges of Surgeons of Edinburgh and Ireland* 5(2): 6-89, 2007.
- Flin R, O'Connor P, Crichton M: 現場安全への 技術:ノンテクニカルスキル・ガイドブック.小 松原明哲, 十亀洋, 中西美和(訳), (Japanese translation of "Safety at the sharp end"). Kaibundo Publishing Co, Tokyo, 2012.
- 9) Mitchell L, Flin R: 手洗い従事者の術中ノンテクニ カルスキルリスト. 松本尚浩, 榎本晶, 小舘尚文(訳), (Japanese translation of "Scrub practitioners: list of intra-operative non-technical skills"). 2011. http://www.abdn.ac.uk/iprc/uploads/files/ Japanese%20SPLINTS%20Handbook.pdf
- Takahashi R: Introduction to non-technical skills training (Japanese). In: Nakajima K, Kodama Y (Eds): *Iryo anzen kotohajime* (Introduction to patient safety). Igakushoin, Tokyo, 35-53, 2010.
- Tsuburaya A: Non-technical skills for surgeons: desired actions and skills for patient safety (Japanese). Shukan Igakukai Shinbun 06 Aug 2012.
- 12) University of Osaka Hospital: Non-technical skills in healthcare: practice and training (Japanese).
 In: Central Office for Managing Quality (Ed), 2012.
- Kanki BG, Helmreich RL, Anca Jr. JM: Crew resource management. 2nd ed. ed: Academic Press, 2010.
- 14) Fletcher G, Flin R, McGeorge P, Glavin R, Maran N, Patey R: Anaesthetists' non-technical skills (ANTS): evaluation of a behavioural marker system. *British Journal of Anaesthesia* 90(5): 580-58, 2003.
- 15) Saurin TA, Wachs P, Henriqson É: Identification

of non-technical skills from the resilience engineering perspective: a case study of an electricity distributor. *Safety Science* 51(1): 37-48, 2013.

- 16) Verbano C, Turra F: A human factors and reliability approach to clinical risk management: evidence from Italian cases. *Safety Science* 48(5): 625-639, 2010.
- 17) Nestel D, Walker K, Simon R, Aggarwal R, Andreatta P: Nontechnical skills: an inaccurate and unhelpful descriptor? Simulation in Healthcare: *The Journal of the Society for Simulation in Healthcare* 6(1): 2-3, 2011.
- 18) Glavin RJ: Skills, training, and education. Simulation in Healthcare: The Journal of the Society for Simulation in Healthcare 6(1): 4-7. 2011.
- 19) Cooper S, Endacott R, Cant R: Measuring nontechnical skills in medical emergency care: a review of assessment measures. *Emergency Medicine* 2: 7-16, 2010.
- 20) NHS PCC (Primary Care Commissioning): Support for non-medical prescribers (NMP)'s nontechnical skills. 2012 [04.09.2012]; Available from: http://www.pcc.nhs.uk/news/712
- 21) Engle N, Patey RE, Ross S, Wisely L: Nontechnical skills. *Student BMJ* 16:454-445, 2008.
- 22) Gaba DM: Training and nontechnical skills: the politics of terminology. Simulation in Healthcare: The Journal of the Society for Simulation in Healthcare 6(1): 8-10, 2011.
- 23) Gordon RPE: The contribution of human factors to accidents in the offshore oil industry. *Reliability Engineering & System Safety* 61(1-2): 95-108, 1998.
- 24) Carayon P: Human factors in patient safety as an innovation. *Applied Ergonomics* 41(5):657-665, 2010.
- 25) Riley W, Davis S, Miller K, Hansen H, Sainfort F, Sweet R: Didactic and Simulation Nontechnical Skills Team Training to Improve Perinatal Patient Outcomes in a Community Hospital. *Joint Commission Journal on Quality and Patient* Safety 37(8): 357-364, 2011.

- 26) Flowerdew L, Brown R, Vincent C, Woloshynowych M: Development and validation of a tool to assess emergency physicians' nontechnical skills. Annals of Emergency Medicine 59(5): 376-85.e4, 2012.
- 27) McCulloch P, Mishra A, Handa A, Dale T, Hirst G, Catchpole K: The effects of aviation-style nontechnical skills training on technical performance and outcome in the operating theatre. *Quality* and Safety in Health Care 18(2): 109-115, 2009.
- 28) Taylor CR, Hepworth JT, Buerhaus PI, Dittus R, Speroff T: Effect of crew resource management on diabetes care and patient outcomes in an innercity primary care clinic. *Quality and Safety in Health Care* 16(4): 244-247, 2007.
- 29) Gettman MT, Pereira CW, Lipsky K, Wilson T, Arnold JJ, Leibovich BC, et al: Use of high fidelity operating room simulation to assess and teach communication, teamwork and laparoscopic skills: initial experience. *The Journal of Urology* 181(3): 1289-1296, 2009.
- 30) Conrad M, Guhde J, Brown D, Chronister C, Ross-Alaolmolki K: Transformation leadership: instituting a nursing simulation program. *Clinical Simulation in Nursing* 7(5): e189-e195, 2010.
- 31) Teherani A, Hauer KE, O'Sullivan P: Can simulations measure empathy? Considerations on how to assess behavioral empathy via simulations. *Patient education and counseling* 71(2): 148-152, 2008.
- 32) Schiff R, Jensen H, Jaye P, Mulligan P, Hetherington T, Ross AJ: Care and compassion; a novel multifaceted programme improves the nontechnical skills of caring for frail older people. Age and Ageing 41(suppl 2): ii71, 2012.
- 33) Pearson E, McLafferty I: The use of simulation as a learning approach to non-technical skills awareness in final year student nurses. Nurse Education in Practice 11(6): 399-405. 2011.
- 34) Buckley T, Gordon C: The effectiveness of high fidelity simulation on medical-surgical registered nurses' ability to recognise and respond to clinical emergencies. *Nurse Education Today* 31(7):716-721, 2011.

- 35) Paige J, Kozmenko V, Morgan B, Howell DS, Chauvin S, Hilton C, et al: From the Flight Deck to the Operating Room: An Initial Pilot Study of the Feasibility and Potential Impact of True Interdisciplinary Team Training using High-Fidelity Simulation. *Journal of Surgical Education* 64(6): 369-377, 2007.
- 36) Allan CK, Thiagarajan RR, Beke D, Imprescia A, Kappus LJ, Garden A, et al: Simulation-based training delivered directly to the pediatric cardiac intensive care unit engenders preparedness, comfort, and decreased anxiety among multidisciplinary resuscitation teams. J Thorac Cardiovasc Surg 140(3): 646-652, 2010.
- 37) Anderson JE, Ross AJ, Lim R, Kodate N, Thompson K, Jensen H, et al: Understanding nursing teamwork in older peoples' care: a mixed methods analysis using the Healthcare Team Model. (Manuscript submitted for publication)
- 38) Ross AJ, Anderson JE, Kodate N, Thomas L, Thompson K, Thomas B, et al: Simulation training for improving the quality of care for older people: An independent evaluation of an innovative programme for inter-professional education. BMJ Quality & Safety, 2013. (in press)
- 39) Firth-Cozens J, Cornwell J: The point of care: enabling compassionate care in acute hospital settings. King's Fund, London, 2009.
- 40) Department of Health: The NHS Constitution for England: the NHS belongs to us all. In: Department of Health (Ed), London, 2012.
- 41) Hudson R: Unthinkable nursing. Do unto others... Nursing Standards 23(8): 20-21, 2008.
- 42) Wear D, Zarconi J: Can compassion be taught? Let's ask our students. Journal of General Internal Medicine 23(7): 948-953, 2008.
- 43) Mishra A, Catchpole K, McCulloch P: The Oxford NOTECHS System: reliability and validity of a tool for measuring teamwork behaviour in the operating theatre. *Quality and Safety in Health Care* 18(2): 104-108, 2009.
- 44) Fletcher G, Flin R, McGeorge P, Glavin R, Maran N, Patey R: Rating non-technical skills: developing a behavioural marker system for use

in anaesthesia. *Cognition, Technology and Work* 6: 165-171, 2004.

- 45) University of Aberdeen: Anaesthetists' Non-Technical Skills (ANTS) System Handbook. Industrial Psychology Research Centre, School of Psychology, University of Aberdeen, 2003. Available from: www.abdn.ac.uk/iprc/ANTS.
- 46) Yule S, Flin R, Maran N, Youngson G, Mitchell A, Rowley D, et al: Debriefing surgeons on nontechnical skills (NOTSS). Cognition, *Technology* and Work 10(4): 265-274, 2008.
- 47) Yule S, Flin R, Paterson-Brown S, Maran N, Rowley DR, Youngson G: Surgeons' non-technical skills in the operating room: reliability testing of the NOTSS behaviour rating system. World Journal of Surgery 32: 548-556, 2008.
- 48) Mitchell L, Flin R: Non-technical skills of the operating theatre scrub nurse: literature review. *Journal of Advanced Nursing* 63(1): 15-24, 2008.
- 49) University of Aberdeen: Scrub Practitioners' List of Intraoperative Non-Technical Skills (SPLINTS): Industrial Psychology Research Centre, School of Psychology, University of Aberdeen, 2008. Available from: http://www.abdn.ac.uk/iprc/ splints/.
- 50) Parker SH, Flin R, McKinley A, Yule S: The surgeons' leadership inventory (SLI): a taxonomy and rating system for surgeons' intraoperative leadership skills. *The American Journal of Surgery*, 2012.
- 51) Hull L, Arora S, Aggarwal R, Darzi A, Vincent C, Sevdalis N: The impact of nontechnical skills on technical performance in surgery: a systematic review. Journal of the American College of Surgeons 214(2): 214-230, 2012.
- 52) Mitchell L, Flin R, Yule S, Mitchell J, Coutts K, Youngson G: Evaluation of the scrub practitioners' list of intraoperative non-technical skills (SPLINTS) system. *International Journal of Nursing Studies* 49(2): 201-211, 2012.
- 53) Flin R, Patey R: Non-technical skills for anaesthetists: developing and applying ANTS. Best Practice & Research Clinical Anaesthesiology 25(2): 215-227, 2011.

- 54) Mitchell L, Flin R, Yule S, Mitchell J, Coutts K, Youngson G: Thinking ahead of the surgeon. An interview study to identify scrub nurses' nontechnical skills. *International Journal of Nursing Studies* 48(7): 818-828, 2011.
- 55) Mitchell L, Mitchell J: 'Pass the buzzy thing, please.' Recognising and understanding information: an essential non-technical skill element for the efficient scrub practitioner. *Journal of Perioperative Practice* 21(6): 203-205, 2011.
- 56) Mäkinen M, Aune S, Niemi-Murola L, Herlitz J, Varpula T, Nurmi J, et al: Assessment of CPR-D skills of nurses in Göteborg, Sweden and Espoo, Finland: teaching leadership makes a difference. *Resuscitation* 72(2): 264-269, 2007.
- 57) Lake S, McInnes RJ: Exploring cognitive skill development in midwifery education. Nurse Education in Practice 12(5): 264-268, 2012.
- 58) Pike T, O'Donnell V: The impact of clinical simulation on learner self-efficacy in preregistration nursing education. Nurse Education Today 30(5): 405-410, 2010.
- Hutchins E: Cognition in the wild. MIT, Boston, MA, 1995.
- 60) Clancey WJ: Situated cognition: on human knowledge and computer representation. Cambridge University Press, New York, 1997.
- 61) Carayon P, Schoofs A, Karsh B-T, Gurses A, Alvarado C, Smith M, et al: Work system design for patient safety: The SEIPS model. *Quality and Safety in Healthcare* 15(1): i50-i58, 2006.
- 62) Ross AJ, Anderson JE, Kodate N, Thompson K, Cox A, Malik R: Inpatient diabetes care: complexity, resilience and quality of care. Cogn Tech Work:1-12, 2012.
- 63) Hollnagel E: Prologue: the scope of resilience engineering. In: Hollnagel E, Paries J, Wreathall J (Eds): *Resilience engineering in practice: a guidebook*. Ashgate, Farnham, Surrey, 3-8, 2010.
- 64) Nemeth CP, Wears RL, Woods DD, Hollnagel E, Cook RI: Minding the gaps: creating resilience in healthcare. In: Henriksen K, Battles JB, Keyes MA, Grady ML (Eds): Advances in patient safety:

特集

new directions and alternative approaches Vol 3 performance and tools. AHRQ, Rockville, MD, 2008.

- 65) Wallace B, Ross AJ: Beyond human error: taxonomies and safety science. CRC Press, Boca-Raton, FL, 2006.
- 66) Woods DD, Wreathall J: Essential characteristics of resilience. In: Hollnagel E, Woods DD, Leveson N (Eds): *Resilience engineering: concepts and precepts*. Ashgate, Aldershot, 21-34, 2006.
- 67) Hollnagel E: The four cornerstones of resilience engineering. In: Nemeth C, Hollnagel E, Dekker S (Eds) : *Resilience engineering perspectives, Vol2* preparation and restoration. Ashgate, Farnham, Surrey, 117-134, 2009.
- 68) Riem N, Boet S, Bould MD, Tavares W, Naik VN: Do technical skills correlate with non-technical

skills in crisis resource management: a simulation study. *British Journal of Anaesthesia*, 2012.

- 69) Beard J, Marriott J, Purdie H, Crossley J: Assessing the surgical skills of trainees in the operating theatre: a prospective observational study of the methodology. *Health Technology* Assessment 15(1): 1-168. 2011.
- 70) Crossley J, Marriott J, Purdie H, Beard JD: Prospective observational study to evaluate NOTSS (Non-Technical Skills for Surgeons) for assessing trainees' non-technical performance in the operating theatre. *British Journal of Surgery* 98(7): 1010-1020, 2011.
- 71) Amalberti R: The paradoxes of almost totally safe transportaion systems. Safety Science 37(2-3): 109-126, 2001.