

# Schubert, Goethe and the *Singspiel*. An Elective Affinity

Lorraine Byrne

Departments of German and Music

Over the years a number of myths have evolved around Goethe and Schubert. Goethe has been branded by musicologists as being unmusical, while Schubert's literary gifts are continually rebuked. Traditionally these artists are placed in opposition to each other, both in terms of their experience in life, and in relation to their conception of words and music in the German *Lied*. Despite the disparity in their social circumstances, they share striking similarities in their aesthetic experience, and these similarities are clearly seen in their encounter with the German *Singspiel*, or German opera in which musical numbers are separated by dialogue.

## *Goethe and Opera*

Whereas Goethe's involvement in music is usually discussed in relation to the nineteenth-century *Lied*, his interest in improving the German *Singspiel* occupied him for many years. Goethe is repeatedly criticized for his lack of musicality, yet his work on the *Singspiel* bears testimony to his active involvement in music. His desire to elevate the *Singspiel* to an artistic level commensurate with the other arts in Germany, and with Italian *opera buffa*, inspired him to produce several works in this form. Between the years 1773 and 1784 Goethe produced six *Singspiele*. His first work, *Erwin und Elmire*, was written in 1773 and followed by *Claudine von Villa Bella* in 1774. *Lila* was composed in 1777, followed by *Jery und Bätely* in 1779. *Die Fischerin* emerged in 1782, and then came *Scherz, List und Rache* in 1784. In addition to the *Singspiele*, Goethe commenced four operatic works, all of which remain fragmentary in form. The first, fourth and fifth acts of *Die ungleichen Hausgenossen* were written between November 1785 and February 1786; while the libretto for *Der Zauberflöte zweiter Teil* followed ten years later, at the end of 1795. *Der Löwenstuhl* emerged in 1814 and *Feradeddin und Kolaila*, which is connected with the *West-östlicher Divan*, occupied his thoughts from 1815 to 1816.

Goethe's work as a librettist inspired his collaboration with various composers in this field. The first of these encounters was with Johann André, in the autumn of 1773. As André's opera, *Der Töpfer*, had greatly impressed him,<sup>i</sup> the poet invited him to write music for *Erwin und Elmire*, which was printed in the journal, *Iris*, in March 1775 and received its first performance in Frankfurt am Main on 13 September the same year.<sup>ii</sup>

Despite its immediate success, Goethe was very critical of the work. In a letter to Kestner in 1773 he had admitted that it was ‘created without any great expense of spirit or feeling for the actors and the stage’,<sup>iii</sup> and subsequently he decided to revise the text. With this redaction he moved away from André and sought the advice of Philipp Christoph Kayser, with whom he collaborated on *Jery und Bätely*, *Scherz*, *List und Rache* and *Die ungleichen Hausgenossen*. In a letter to Kayser on 23 January 1786, he reveals his plans for revision and encloses an outline of the musical requirements for the work.<sup>iv</sup> The corrections were completed in Italy and four months later he enclosed the text in a letter to Charlotte von Stein with the remark:

*Erwin und Elmire* kommt mit diesem Brief, möge Dir das Stückchen auch Vergnügen machen. Doch kann eine Operette, wenn sie gut ist, niemals im Lesen genug tun; es muß die Musik erst dazu kommen, um den ganzen Begriff auszudrücken, den der Dichter sich vorstellte.

[*Erwin und Elmire* is enclosed with this letter: the little piece might give you pleasure. When an operetta is good, it is never enough that it is read; in order for the poet’s conception to be adequately expressed, it must be set to music.<sup>v</sup>

Following his return from Italy Goethe gradually became estranged from Kayser. Though he recognized his talent,<sup>vi</sup> Kayser’s method of work was very slow and often his work remained incomplete.<sup>vii</sup> However, the end of their partnership did not mark the demise of Goethe’s interest in this form, for in Reichardt he discovered a composer whose way of working ran closer to his own. Reichardt’s first collaboration with Goethe was on *Claudine von Villa Bella*,<sup>viii</sup> when he visited the poet in Weimar at the end of April 1789 and played through his rendition of this work. The first performance was given in the *Charlottenburger Schloßtheater* on 29 July 1789. It was the first German opera to be presented to the Prussian court and for Reichardt it represented his transition from conductor of Italian court opera to composer of German *Singspiel* and the *Lied*.<sup>ix</sup>

Mozart’s operas had a decisive effect on Goethe’s desire to improve the German *Singspiel*. However, when Goethe heard *Die Entführung aus dem Serail*, he realized that his aim had already been fulfilled.<sup>x</sup> While Miller claims that: ‘it was directly because of *Die Entführung* that Goethe stopped his efforts in the field of opera text writing’,<sup>xi</sup> when one examines the poet’s response to the opera, it becomes clear that his criticism does not concur with Goethe’s comments on this work. In a letter to Kayser dated 22 December 1785, Goethe criticizes this opera and questions the public acclaim it received.<sup>xii</sup> Although Goethe’s appraisal is traditionally interpreted as a lack of musical insight,<sup>xiii</sup> when one examines the details of Goethe’s life, his admiration of Mozart is overt. From the time of his appointment as director of the Weimar Hoftheater in 1791 to his resignation in 1817, Goethe arranged for Mozart’s operas *Le Nozze di Figaro*, *Don Giovanni*, *Così fan Tutte*, *Titus*, *Die Zauberflöte* and *Die Entführung aus dem Serail* to be performed repeatedly and his letters and conversations with Eckermann frequently praise the composer’s work. Consequently, the ‘difference’ between Goethe’s opinion and the

public appraisal of this work does not suggest a lack of understanding of Mozart's genius, but reveals the poet's ability to give an objective criticism of the composer's work. His critique does not reveal a lack of musicality, but rather his musical discernment, and reveals his concern over the synthesis between composer and poet, text and song. Furthermore, though Goethe recognized that Mozart had accomplished his aim in improving the German *Singspiel*,<sup>xiv</sup> it was not the actualization of this aim, but rather Mozart's demise which gradually curtailed Goethe's work. Through his experience with Kayser, André, and Reichardt, Goethe had realized that he would never work with a composer of genius who could bring his text to life in the manner he envisioned. With Mozart's death, this awareness was affirmed and the sequel he planned to *Die Zauberflöte* remained incomplete.<sup>xv</sup>

As with his conception of the *Lied*, Goethe's belief in the relationship between words and music in opera is widely misunderstood. In an analysis of Goethe's relationship with opera, Hicks cites Goethe's letter to Kayser on 5 May 1786, where he claims:

Der Dichter eines musikalischen Stückes, wie er es dem Komponisten hingibt, muß es ansehen, wie einen Sohn oder Zögling, den er eines neuen Herren Diensten widmet.

[When the author of a musical work hands over his text to the composer, he must see it as a son or a pupil, who has acquired a new master.]<sup>xvi</sup>

Hicks interprets this comment as Goethe's belief in the subordination of poetry to music. However, when one examines Goethe's correspondence, the poet's belief in the importance of unity between words and music emerges. He criticizes Italian opera on this account, noting:

Der Italiener wird sich der lieblichsten Harmonie, der gefälligsten Melodie befleißigen, er wird sich an dem Zusammenklang, an der Bewegung als solchen ergötzen, er wird des Sängers Kehle zu Rate ziehn [...] und so das gebildete Ohr seiner Landsleute entzücken. Er wird aber auch dem Vorwurf nicht entgehen, seinem Text, da er zum Gesang doch einmal Text haben muß, keineswegs genuggetan zu haben

[The Italian applies himself to the loveliest harmonies, the most engaging melodies; he exercises great care with the harmony, the movement and the vocal line [...] and so charms the educated ear of his fellowmen. However, as the literary themes escape his attention, the songs have not enough to do with the text]<sup>xvii</sup>

Similarly, in conversation with Eckermann, he admits that he can only enjoy an opera when the text attains the same perfection as the music<sup>xviii</sup> and he reinforces the importance of the unity of arts in this form.<sup>xix</sup> Though the poet asserts that 'the libretto should be a pasteboard, not a complete picture',<sup>xx</sup> his perception does not suggest an inequality between words and music as Hicks suggests, but rather it shows his

recognition of the power of abstract expression which occurs in music. In the correspondence cited by Hicks, the poet continues:

Es fragt sich nicht mehr, was Vater oder Lehrer aus dem Knaben machen wollen, sondern wozu ihn sein Gebieter bilden will; glücklich, wenn er das Handwerk besser versteht als die ersten Erzieher.

[It is not a question of what the father or teacher makes out of the boy, but what he will build him into; the situation is prosperous if he understands the work better than the first educator]<sup>xxi</sup>

Consequently, Goethe's relinquishment of the text does not suggest subservience, but recognises the power of the musician to bring the work to its final form. His identification of the musician as a 'master' does not support the accepted notion of an inferior quality text, but stresses the need for understanding on his part. Ultimately, his exegesis of texts does not uphold the poet's 'musical conservatism', but reveals his desire to attain unity of form.<sup>xxii</sup>

### *Schubert and Opera*

During his life-time Schubert was recognized first and foremost as a composer of songs, yet in the realm of theatre music he was not unknown. Between December 1811 and March 1828, he composed eighteen stage works, seven of which are fragmentary in form. His early *Singspiele*, *Der Spiegelritter* (D11 and D966) and *Des Teufels Lustschloß* (D84), which date from 1811 and 1814, are both incomplete<sup>xxiii</sup> and composed to texts by Kotzbue. The following year three *Singspiele* were composed: *Der vierjährige Posten* (D190) by Körner, *Fernando* (D220) by Stadler and a setting of Goethe's *Claudine von Villa Bella* (D239). In 1816, Schubert completed Mayrhofer's *Die Freunde von Salamanka* (D326), followed by *Der Minnesänger* (D981) and the opera *Die Bürgschaft* (D435),<sup>xxiv</sup> both of which are fragmentary in form.<sup>xxv</sup> Between 1818 and 1820 his settings of Hofmann's texts were performed: *Die Zwillingbrüder* (D647) was produced in the *Kärntnertheater*, while the melodrama, *Die Zauberharfe* (D644), was presented in the *Theater an der Wien*. Between these two productions, Schubert commenced work on Mayrhofer's opera *Adrast* (D137) and Niemeyer's oratorio, *Lazarus* (D689), and the succeeding operas, *Sacontala* (D701), *Sophie* (D902) were also unfinished works. Schubert's next commission was for a duet and an aria which would be included in Herold's *opéra comique*, *Das Zauberlücken* (D732); though the aria was unpopular, the duet received eight performances in the *Kärntnertheater*, commencing on 20 June 1821. Between 1821 and 1824 he worked on Schober's opera *Alfonso und Estrella* (D732), Castelli's *Die Verschworenen* (D787), Kupelwieser's opera *Fierrabras* (D796), and the incidental music for Chezy's *Rosamund* (D797), which was performed at the *Theatre an der Wien* in 1823. *Rüdiger* (D791) and *Der Graf von Gleichen* (D918) were sketched in 1823 and 1828, both of which remained incomplete. While Schubert's stage works did not attain the success he hoped, the performance of excerpts in concerts, given during March 1812 and April 1822, ensured that Schubert's name became known.

In view of Schubert's extensive involvement with the theatre, it remains to be asked why he did not achieve success in this realm. The traditional response to this question is that the composer's judgement of texts was inept. When one considers 'Schubert's lack of literary judgement' in relation to Goethe's comments on the romantic conception of a composer, it is clear how this myth has emerged. In a letter to Zelter the poet complains how the myth of the composer's literary insensibility is continually reinforced<sup>xxvi</sup> and in conversation with Eckermann he stresses the need to recognize a composer's ability to judge the literary value of texts.<sup>xxvii</sup> In relation to Schubert, Goethe's comments are intriguing, for he refutes the very image which has grown up around the composer. Although in recent years musicologists<sup>xxviii</sup> have begun to recognize Schubert's literary discernment in relation to the *Lied*, the myth is still present in contemporary studies of this genre. In a recent study on *Schubert's Music for the Theatre*, Elizabeth Norman McKay acknowledges the number of operatic fragments which the composer left behind and yet concludes that Schubert 'had little critical idea of what was needed [...] and if his text was poor and undramatic, he followed it slavishly to the last'.<sup>xxix</sup> Yet surely the number of incomplete works bears testimony to the fact that Schubert did not 'slavishly adhere' to the text. His abandonment of these works does not point to Schubert's 'inability' to judge a literary text, but rather to his inability to find a librettist. At the time when Schubert was writing there was a marked lack of good librettists in Vienna<sup>xxx</sup> and so, like Goethe, he had to rely on contacts through his circle of friends. Like the poet, Schubert's failure in this area is due to the fact that he never worked with an artist of the same calibre and his effort in this field gradually gave way to other forms.

#### *Schubert's setting of Claudine von Villa Bella.*

Whereas Goethe and Schubert did not work with an artist of equal standing, their ambition was realized through Schubert's setting of *Claudine von Villa Bella*. Like Reichardt, Schubert worked on the second edition of the text. He commenced work on *Claudine von Villa Bella* on 26 July 1815 and finished Act I on 5 August 1815. Although Schubert completed the *Singspiel*, the music for Acts II and III was burnt as fuel by Josef Hüttenbrenner's servants during the revolution in Vienna in 1848.<sup>xxxii</sup> All that remains of the existing score for *Claudine von Villa Bella* is an overture, an introduction (trio), an ensemble, two *ariette* and two arias, a *Räuberlied* for tenor and male voice choir and the finale to Act I, with sketches of the vocal parts for Rugantino's tenor *arietta*, 'Liebliches Kind', in Act II scene ii<sup>xxxiii</sup> and for Claudine's part for her duet with Pedro, 'Mich umfängt ein banger Schauer' ('A disquieting thrill takes hold of me') in Act III. While Schubert's score is fragmentary in form, his achievement in setting Goethe's libretto shows him capable of unleashing considerable dramatic power in his handling of the text. Although Denny argues that from the early 1820s Schubert's operas 'stand clearly above his earlier efforts, both in their ambitions and their achievement',<sup>xxxiii</sup> in *Claudine von*

*Villa Bella* Schubert achieves a synthesis between words and music, which is absent from his later dramatic works.

In setting *Claudine von Villa Bella*, Schubert sought to build on what Mozart had accomplished and so his rendition directly mirrors Goethe's aims. Like Goethe, Schubert's interest in this form stemmed from his love of Italian opera and this influence is apparent in his composition of *Claudine*. The Italian manner is first introduced through the *Vivace* section of the overture, whose development is episodic and even includes a short *stretta*. The vocal numbers are Mozartian in style and the ensemble which follows the introduction is clearly influenced by the *Giovanni liete* from Mozart's *Figaro*. As the main interest of Italian opera in the early nineteenth century was in the vocal line, Schubert's setting draws on this tradition, combining it carefully with orchestration, which he learned from Salieri. The classical nature of his score mirrors the poet's interest in *opera buffa* and through this imitation of Mozart, Schubert's rendition mirrors the poet's objectives in revising the *Singspiel*. The unity which Schubert achieves between words and music in Goethe's *Singspiel* evolves from their similar conception of this form. In concert with Goethe's ambitions to improve the standard of libretto-writing for the German *Singspiel*, Schubert pursued the perfection of its musical form. Like Goethe, his interest in the *Lied* led him to focus on the unity of words and music and his realization of *Claudine* reveals his ability to get to the heart of the poet's words, while portraying an understanding of character and scene.

Over the years Schubert's setting of *Claudine von Villa Bella* has been greatly criticized. In his recent study, *Schubert. The Music and the Man*, Newbould maintains that the work 'displays a lightness of touch that ultimately produces a bland effect, there being little in the way of imaginative phrase-structure or resourceful harmonic invention or notable orchestration to arrest the ear'.<sup>xxxiv</sup> Like Einstein, who criticizes the introductory *Adagio* of the Overture for being 'almost too serious, with its mysterious dynamic and harmonic contrasts',<sup>xxxv</sup> Newbould denounces the orchestration 'as an extreme example of Schubert's almost obsessive fondness for quavers in the violins as a means of giving them something distinctive which avoids simply doubling the vocal parts in voices-and-instruments media'.<sup>xxxvi</sup> However, in appraising *Claudine von Villa Bella*, it should be kept in mind that Schubert was only eighteen when he composed this *Singspiel* and consequently, the strength of his achievement lies in the vocal domain. As with his development of the *Lied*, Schubert had composed a number of *Singspiele* when he took up Goethe's text and had learned much from his earlier work within this genre. Yet in order to become creative in the highest sense, Schubert's unique gift of literary receptivity needed a decisive impulse and this he acquired through his encounter with Goethe's work. In setting *Claudine von Villa Bella* Schubert attains a perfect fusion between words and music.<sup>xxxvii</sup> His setting reflects his dramatic powers and conveys the poet's perception of this form. Yet even very recent criticism of this work does not acknowledge his achievement in this area. Elizabeth Norman McKay considers that in

composing Claudine's aria, 'Alle Freunde, alle Gaben' Schubert 'broke away from the *Liederspiel* conventions favoured by Goethe and wrote a small-scale operatic aria demanding some high soprano coloratura'.<sup>xxxviii</sup> Yet in his revision of this text, Goethe also broke away from this practice and aimed at a more operatic form. The *arioso* setting of Claudine's song reflects Goethe's perception of the solo aria,<sup>xxxix</sup> and his setting mirrors the poetic form. While McKay acknowledges that Pedro's aria, 'Es erhebt sich eine Stimme', 'clearly fired Schubert's imagination', she concedes that 'the composer again fell into the way of writing many phrases of rather similar pattern, especially in the middle section'.<sup>xl</sup> However, Schubert's arrangement of the aria into two *fortissimo* sections and a *pianissimo* love song conveys the protagonist's sense of indecision, as he is caught between the call of duty and of love. In addition, Schubert's use of repetition heightens the dramatic tension and mirrors the poet's restatement of structures through this strophe. Although McKay considers Schubert's setting of the 'Räuberlied' 'does not fit the scene', his rendition focuses on the first two stanzas, which highlights the romance rather than the asperity of the bandits' lives. Finally, the designation of Goethe's *Claudine von Villa Bella* as 'Ein Schauspiel mit Gesang' and later as 'Ein Singspiel', marks it as a dramatic work with a liberal infusion of song. As Schubert's setting maintains this spoken discourse, it maintains the connection of the work to the German *Liederspiel*.

If Schubert's setting of *Claudine* achieves such unanimity, it remains to be asked why it was never performed. When one examines the music produced in Vienna, the reasons for its preclusion emerge. Schubert lived in an age of Biedermeier sentimentality, where *Ritterdrama* and *Zauberspiel* were popular with Viennese audiences. Consequently, Schubert's aim to produce serious German opera was not in concert with the taste of the general public.<sup>xli</sup> Although Elizabeth Norman McKay claims that *Claudine von Villa Bella* falls within the type of *Singspiel* performed in the court *Kärntnertortheater* and the *Theater an der Wien*, which were alive with German *Singspiele* in 1815-1816,<sup>xlii</sup> the classicism of Goethe's *Claudine* is in direct contrast with the romantic texts of Viennese artists, for though the tone is light, its songs carry serious import.<sup>xliii</sup>

To conclude: it is the lack of historic and contemporary performances of *Claudine von Villa Bella*, which has contributed to the misunderstanding of Goethe's and Schubert's achievements in this field. Whereas a *Lied* expresses individual moods and possibly a succession of them, we do not see the elements acted out as in a scene. Unlike *Lieder*, the *Singspiel* communicates through a combination of music, literature and drama. The expressive character of the *Singspiel* results from a very special use of musical and literary elements, each of them serving an effective theatrical goal. To listen to an opera for the music alone is like listening to a *Lied* without any understanding of what is being said. In both cases, music is only part of the communication. Whereas the earliest term for opera, *dramma per musica*, recognises this need for balance between

these arts, many musicologists consider that it is the music and not the words that principally determine an opera's aesthetic value.<sup>xliv</sup> Yet, in order to appreciate the total impact of Goethe's and Schubert's *Claudine*, one requires the unity of the elements which is only achieved in performance; a unity which both artists recognised as opera's proper domain.

## BIBLIOGRAPHY

### PRIMARY SOURCES

- Deutsch (1996), *Schubert: Die Dokumente seines Lebens und Schaffens*, 3<sup>rd</sup> edition, revised, Leipzig, Paris and Wiesbaden, Breitkopf & Härtel
- Goethe, J. W., *Werke*, Berliner Ausgabe, Hamburger Ausgabe, Weimarer Ausgabe (Translations are by Lorraine Byrne.)
- Houben, Hubert (ed.) (1959), Eckermann, Johann Peter, *Gespräche mit Goethe*, 25<sup>th</sup> edition, Wiesbaden, F.A. Brockhaus (Translations are by Lorraine Byrne.)

### SECONDARY SOURCES

- Denny, Thomas A. (1997), 'Schubert's operas: "the judgement of history?"' in *The Cambridge Companion to Schubert*, edited by Christopher Gibbs, Cambridge, Cambridge University Press, pp. 224-38.
- Einstein (1951), *A Musical Portrait*, New York, Oxford University Press
- Friedländer, Max (1970), *Das deutsche Lied im 18. Jahrhundert*, revised edition, Berlin and Stuttgart, Georg Olms Verlag.
- Gibbs, Christopher (ed.) (1997), *The Cambridge Companion to Schubert*, Cambridge, Cambridge University Press.
- Gramit, David (1987), *The Intellectual and Aesthetic Tenets of Franz Schubert's Circle: Their Development and their Influences on His Music*, Ph.D. dissertation, Duke University.
- Hicks, W. C. R. (1958), 'Was Goethe Musical?', *Publications of the English Goethe Society*, 27, 73-139.
- Hilmar, Ernst (1988), *Schubert in his Time*, Oregon, Amadeus Press.
- Hilmar, Ernest (1997), *Franz Schubert*, Hamburg, Rowohlt.
- Langer, Suzanne K. (1953), *Feeling and Form*, New York, Charles Scribner's Sons.
- McKay, Elizabeth Norman (1982), 'Schubert as a Composer of Operas' in *Schubert Studies*, edited by Eva Badura-Skoda and Peter Branscombe, Cambridge, Cambridge University Press, pp. 85-104.
- McKay, Elizabeth Norman (1991), *Schubert's Music for the Theatre*, Tutzing, Hans Schneider.

Miller, John L. (1972), 'Goethe and Music', *Seminar: A Journal of Germanic Studies*, 8, 42-54.

Newbould, Brian (1997), *Schubert. The Music and the Man*, London, Victor Gollancz.

Stuart, Hannah (1937), 'Goethe's Influence on Music', *Publications of the English Goethe Society*, 12, 1937, 65-81.

Taylor, Ronald (1976), 'Goethe, Schubert and the Art of Song', in *Versuche zu Goethe. Festschrift für Erich Heller*, Heidelberg, pp. 147-48.<sup>xv</sup>

---

<sup>i</sup> See Goethe's letter to *Johanna Falmer*, 1773, *Weimarer Ausgabe (WA.)*, IV, 2, Letter no. 185, 23 November, pp. 123-24.

<sup>ii</sup> The work was performed at *Junghof* under the direction of Theobald March. A further performance was given on 24 May 1776, at the *Liebhabertheater* in Weimar, with music by Anna Amalia. A year later, it opened at the *Döbbelins Theater* in Berlin, where André was *Kapellmeister* and between 1775 and 1782, it received twenty-two performances in Berlin. Other performances of note include the Viennese première in July 1776.

<sup>iii</sup> The letter is cited by Hannah Stuart in 'Goethe's Influence on Music', *Publications of the English Goethe Society*, 12, 1937, 65-81 (p. 68).

<sup>iv</sup> *Goethes Briefe*, 1, *Hamburger Ausgabe (HA.)*, Letter no. 396, *An Kayser*, 23 January 1786, pp. 498-502.

<sup>v</sup> *Italienische Reise, Januar Korrespondenz*, 10 January 1788, p. 475.

<sup>vi</sup> In 1785, Goethe wrote to Kayser: 'Wenn es so weiter geht, mein lieber Kayser, daß das letzte immer das angenehmste bleibt, so können Autor und Publikum mit der Gradation sehr wohl zufrieden sein' ['If it is accepted, my dear Kayser, that the final edition is always the most pleasant, then the author and the public can be well satisfied with that sequence'].and in *IR* he repeats this commendation (*HA.*, 11, 24 November 1787, p. 434). Extracts from Kayser's work, which are published by Max Friedländer in the *Schriften der Goethegesellschaft*, 11 and 31, affirm that the poet's praise was well deserved.

<sup>vii</sup> For example, Kayser's score for *Jery und Bätely* and the incidental music for *Egmont* are unfinished.

<sup>viii</sup> Reichardt composed four of Goethe's *Singspiele*: *Jery und Bätely* (1789), *Erwin und Elmire* (1791), *Claudine von Villa Bella* (1789) and *Lila* (1791?). Three of his settings from *Claudine* are included in Reichardt's *Goethes Lieder II, Band 59, Anhang Verstreut überlieferte Kompositionen*: the *Räuberlied: 'Mit Mädeln sich vertragen'* from Act I, scene ii, p. 84; the *'Mondschein-Szene'* sung by Claudine, Rugantino and Lucinda in Act II, scene i, pp.82-83; and Rugantino's serenade, *'Liebliches Kind'* from Act II, scene ii, pp. 77-78.

<sup>ix</sup> Although Goethe praised Reichardt's rendition of his work, his musical discernment is seen in a conversation with Eckermann on *Claudine von Villa Bella* on 8 April 1829, where he observes of Reichardt's score: 'Zwar ist die Musik vortrefflich. Nur ist die Instrumentierung, dem Geschmack der früheren Zeit gemäß, ein wenig schwach. Man müßte jetzt in dieser Hinsicht etwas nachhelfen und die Instrumentierung ein wenig stärker und voller machen.' ['The music is indeed excellent. Only the instrumentation, corresponding to the taste of an earlier period, is a little weak. In this regard the instrumentation must be revised, and made stronger and fuller.'], Johann Peter Eckermann, *Gespräche mit Goethe*, edited by Hubert Houben, 25<sup>th</sup> edition, Wiesbaden, F.A. Brockhaus, 1959, p. 268.

<sup>x</sup> See for example *Italienische Reise*, November 1787, *HA.*, 11, p. 437.

<sup>xi</sup> John L. Miller, 'Goethe and Music', *Seminar: A Journal of Germanic Studies*, 8, 1972, 42-54 (p. 44).

<sup>xii</sup> *Goethes Briefe Band I, HA.*, Letter no. 393, *An Kayser*, 22 December, 1785, p. 493.

<sup>xiii</sup> See for example, Max Friedländer, *Das deutsche Lied im 18. Jahrhundert*, revised edition, Berlin and Stuttgart, Georg Olms Verlag, 1970, pp. 314-15.

<sup>xiv</sup> In view of the criticism of Goethe's lack of musicality, it is interesting to consider that he was working in the area of the German *Singspiel* at the time when it reached its peak. Such insight into the development of this genre does not suggest an artist in search of musical guidance, but one who clearly understood its forms.

- 
- xv See Goethe's letter to Schiller on 30 December 1797, where he admits: 'durch Mozarts Tod ist alle Aussicht auf etwas Ähnliches vereitelt' ['with Mozart's death, all hope of creating something similar has vanished'] (*Goethes Briefe Band 2*), HA., Letter no. 675, p. 322.
- xvi *Goethes Briefe Band 1*, HA., Letter no. 402, *An Kayser*, 5 May 1786, p. 509.
- xvii *Berliner Ausgabe (BA)*, 21, p. 681.
- xviii Eckermann, *Gespräche*, 9 October 1828, (Houben, p. 220).
- xix Eckermann, *Gespräche*, 22 March 1825, (Houben, p. 425). See also Goethe's correspondence with Charlotte von Stein on 26 January 1786 (*Goethes Briefe*, 1, HA., Letter no. 397, p. 503); with Kayser on 28 February 1786 (WA., IV, 7, Letter no. 2275, pp. 184-88), his letter to Fürst Lobkowitz on 7 October 1812 (WA., IV, 23, Letter no. 6394, pp. 110-12) and his correspondence with Zelter on 16 December 1829 (HA., 4, Letter no. 1147, p. 358) and 24 April, 1831 (WA., IV, 48, Letter no. 175-187, pp. 185-87).
- xx *Goethes Briefe*, 3, HA., Letter no. 961, *An Zelter*, 19 May 1812, p. 192. The quotation is cited by W. C. R. Hicks, 'Was Goethe Musical?', *Publications of the English Goethe Society*, 27, 1958, 73-139 (p. 100).
- xxi *Goethes Briefe Band 3*, HA., Letter no. 961, *An Zelter*, 19 May 1812, p. 192.
- xxii While Hicks' article interprets Goethe's suggestions to Kayser about the arrangement of his text as 'laying down the law about the orchestration' (p. 117), Goethe's letters to Kayser, where he speaks of the music for his *Singspiele*, reveal his concern in attaining this unity. See for example his correspondence with Kayser on 20 January 1780 (*Goethes Briefe Band 1*, HA., Letter no. 222, p. 293; on 20 June 1785 (*ibid.*, Letter no. 379, pp. 477-78); 23 January 1786 (*ibid.*, Letter no. 396, pp. 499-500); and 14 August 1787 (WA., IV, 8, Letter no. 2601, pp. 244-45).
- xxiii Schubert composed two workings of *Des Teufels Lustschloß*, though Act II of the revised rendition is lost.
- xxiv As most of Schubert's theatrical works are *Singspiele*, I have indicated the genre when it deviates from this form.
- xxv The fragment for *Der Minnesänger* is lost, while the first two acts of *Die Bürgschaft* are complete.
- xxvi *Goethes Briefe Band 3*, HA., 15 January 1813, Letter no. 975, *An Zelter*, p. 223.
- xxvii Eckermann, *Gespräche*, 20 April 1825 (Houben, p. 119).
- xxviii See for example, Ernst Hilmar, *Schubert in his Time*, Oregon, Amadeus Press, 1988, and *Franz Schubert*, Hamburg, Rowohlt, 1997; David Gramit, *The Intellectual and Aesthetic Tenets of Franz Schubert's Circle: Their Development and their Influences on His Music*, Ph.D. dissertation, Duke University, 1987; Christopher Gibbs (ed.), *The Cambridge Companion to Schubert*, Cambridge, Cambridge University Press, 1997.
- xxix Elizabeth Norman McKay, 'Schubert as a composer of Opera' in *Schubert Studies*, edited by Eva Badura-Skoda and Perter Branscombe, Cambridge, Cambridge University Press, 1982, p. 103. Brian Newbould supports this belief in *Schubert. The Music and the Man*, London, Gollancz, 1997, p.185.
- xxx Elizabeth Norman McKay, *Schubert's Music for the Theatre*, Tutzing, 1991, p. 41.
- xxxi Deutsch, *Schubert: Die Dokumente seines Lebens und Schaffens*, 3<sup>rd</sup> revised edition, Leipzig, Paris and Wiesbaden, Breitkopf & Härtel, 1996, p. 35.
- xxxii Deutsch lists this as Pedro's aria (*Verzeichnis*, p. 156), and the error has been embraced by many musicologists, as for example McKay's appraisal of *Claudine von Villa Bella* in (p. 120). The song is sung by Rugantino in Act II, scene ii, where he serenades Lucinde and Claudine in Alonzo's palace.
- xxxiii Thomas A. Denny, 'Schubert's operas: "the judgement of history?"' in Christopher Gibbs (ed.), *The Cambridge Companion to Schubert*, Cambridge, Cambridge University Press, 1997, p. 236.
- xxxiv Newbould, p. 188.
- xxxv Alfred Einstein, *Schubert: Ein musikalisches Portrait*, revised edition, Zürich, Pan Verlag, 1952, originally translated into English by David Ascoli: *Schubert: A Musical Portrait*, New York, Oxford University Press, 1951, p. 90.
- xxxvi Newbould, p. 188.
- xxxvii For a contrary opinion, see Ronald Taylor, 'Goethe, Schubert and the Art of Song' in *Versuche zu Goethe. Festschrift für Erich Heller*, Heidelberg, 1976, pp. 147-48.
- xxxviii Elizabeth Norman McKay, p. 123. (The *Liederspiel*, a German dramatic musical form deriving from the *Singspiel* and consisting of songs joined by dialogue, was given its most typical form by the composer J. F. Reichardt, who used the manner of German popular music in his songs.)

---

<sup>xxxix</sup> See *Goethes Briefe*, WA., IV, 4, Letter no. 877, *An Kayser*, 29 December 1779, pp. 156-57.

<sup>xi</sup> Elizabeth Norman McKay, p. 123.

<sup>xii</sup> This is seen in contemporary criticism of Schubert's *Singspiele*, for example on 17 June 1820, the *Allgemeine Musikalische Zeitung* observes: 'The music has many original lines and is correctly declaimed, but the blemish of the work lies within the fact that the feelings of simple country folk are too ponderous for a comical subject' (Deutsch, *Dokumente*, p. 92).

<sup>xiii</sup> Elizabeth Norman McKay, *Schubert's Music for the Theatre*, Tutzing, Hans Schneider, 1991, p. 51.

<sup>xiii</sup> This disparity is recognised in records of the Weimar performance of Reichardt's setting of Goethe's *Claudine*, where the work was ill-received and dropped after its first performance.

<sup>xiv</sup> See for example Suzanne K. Langer's *Feeling and Form*, New York, Charles Scribner's Sons, 1953, p. 150.